

Ernest K. Banks

The State Immunity Controversy in International Law

Private Suits Against Sovereign States
in Domestic Courts

 Springer

Contents

1	The Origins of Absolute Immunity of States	1
1.1	Source Analysis.....	1
1.2	Jean Bodin's Philosophy on Sovereignty.....	2
1.3	Thomas Hobbes.....	4
1.4	The Influence of the Philosophy of Thomas Hobbes	5
1.5	Claims and Counter Claims	9
1.6	Final Remarks	11
2	The Development of Sovereign Immunity.....	13
2.1	France before American Courts and its Aftereffects.....	13
2.2	Justice Marshall and his Ground Breaking Rule.....	14
2.3	Analysis of Chief Justice Marshall's Thesis	15
2.4	The Influence of Justice Marshall's Decision	21
2.5	The Influence of Justice Marshall's Judgment on English Courts	22
2.5.1	English Courts and the Sovereign Immunity Question.....	22
2.6	Civil Law Countries and Sovereign Immunity.....	25
2.7	Russia and the Sovereign Immunity Question.....	27
2.8	Is Sovereign Immunity an International Custom?.....	28
2.8.1	A Controversy	28
3	The Privileges and Immunities of States.....	33
3.1	General Observations	33
3.2	The Rational Foundation of State Immunity.....	37
3.3	Diplomatic Immunities and State Sovereignty.....	40
3.4	Comity of Nations, Reciprocity and Peaceful Coexistence.....	41
3.5	The Equality of States in the Sphere of International Law.....	43
3.6	Beneficiaries of State Immunities	46
3.6.1	State Immunity – Claims in English Courts	49
3.6.2	State Immunity in American Courts	58
3.6.3	State Immunity and the Mixed Courts of Egypt	61
3.6.4	State Immunity before South African Courts	63
3.6.5	State Immunity in British Commonwealth States.....	66
4	Restrictive Immunity in U.S. and U.K. Courts	69
4.1	A Move Towards a New Rule.....	69
4.2	Background	69
4.3	Early Practice in Belgium and Italian Courts	70
4.4	A Move Towards Restrictive Immunity.....	72

4.5 Restrictive Immunity and its Implication.....	74
4.6 The Change of Heart in American Practice	77
4.7 Sovereign Immunity Act of 1976: Current U.S. Law	78
4.8 Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts	79
4.9 Issues with Respect to Commencement of Action.....	79
4.10 Commercial Activity under FSIA	80
4.11 Contacts and Direct Effect Approach.....	81
4.12 Arbitration Clauses.....	82
4.12.1 Expropriation Claims.....	83
4.12.2 Non-Commercial Torts.....	84
4.12.3 Counterclaims.....	84
4.12.4 Attachment and Execution	85
4.13 The Change of Heart in British Practice.....	86
4.13.1 The State Immunity Act of the United Kingdom (1978).....	87
4.13.2 Exceptions to Immunity Under the 1978 Act.....	88
4.13.3 Indirect Impleading	90
4.13.4 Waivers of Immunity and Counterclaims.....	91
4.13.5 Execution.....	91
4.13.6 Miscellaneous Considerations	92
4.14 Difficulties in Applying Restrictive Immunity.....	94
4.14.1 Difficulties Associated with Political Acts of State.....	96
4.14.2 Thoughts on Nationalization and Restrictive Immunity.....	97
5 Private Suits Against African Countries in Foreign Courts	101
5.1 Preliminary Observations.....	101
5.2 Evidence of Resistance to the Restrictive Rule.....	104
5.3 Nigeria before English Courts.....	105
5.3.1 Trendtex Trading Corp v. Central Bank of Nigeria.....	105
5.3.2 Nigeria before German Courts	109
5.3.3 Nigeria before American Courts: Part One	111
5.3.4 Nigeria before American Courts: Part Two.....	113
5.4 Uganda before English Courts	115
5.5 Egypt before Indian Courts	116
5.6 United Arab Republic before American Courts	117
5.7 Tunisia before United States Courts.....	118
5.8 Zaire before English Courts	119
5.9 Somali Democratic Republic before American Courts	120
5.10 Libya before American Courts.....	120
5.11 The People's Republic of the Congo before Canadian Courts	122
5.12 Arbitration, Default Judgment and Enforcement.....	123
5.12.1 Nigeria before Switzerland and American Courts.....	123
5.12.2 Tanzania before American Courts.....	124
5.12.3 The Republic of Guinea before American Courts	127
5.12.4 Is Resistance by African States Legally Justified?	128
6 African States and the Practice of State Immunity	133
6.1 Is It Still State Immunity or Restrictive Immunity?	133

6.2	Pre-Colonial Africa and Early African Dynasties	133
6.2.1	Some Concrete Examples of Personal Sovereigns	134
6.3	The Colonial Era	137
6.4	English Sovereign Immunity Law in Africa States	141
6.5	French Sovereign Immunity Law in African States	148
6.6	Africa, Self-Determination and International Law	150
6.7	Reflections on State Practice and Its Implications	153
6.7.1	What Do We Mean by State Practice?.....	154
6.7.2	Municipal Courts and Legal Arguments of a Defendant State	156
6.7.3	Summary of Rules	159
6.8	Custom and the Concept of Persistent Objector.....	160
6.8.1	Are African States Bound by Restrictive Immunity?.....	161
6.9	Some Thoughts on the Persistent Objector Rule.....	165
6.10	The Position of African States on State Immunity.....	168
6.11	Preceding Observations and Conclusions	171
7	The ILC Report on Jurisdictional Immunities of States.....	175
7.1	Composition of the International Law Commission	175
7.2	Some Preliminary Observations.....	176
7.3	Specific Exceptions to Immunity of States	178
7.3.1	Commercial Elements and Jurisdictional Competence	178
7.4	Principles of State Immunity under the Draft Articles.....	181
7.5	Execution against a Foreign State	182
7.6	Personal Injury or Damage to Property.....	184
7.7	Effects of Draft Article 2.2 on Restrictive Immunity.....	187
7.8	Third World Influence on the ILC Deliberations.....	189
7.8.1	Disagreement Over the Draft Articles	192
7.9	The Uncertainty of State Practice	202
8	State Immunity and Certain Unresolved Problems.....	209
8.1	Some Lingered Problems.....	209
8.2	The Problems of Territorial Nexus or Connection.....	210
8.3	Problems of the Nature and Purpose Tests	215
8.4	Mixed Activities of States Involving Private Traders.....	224
8.5	The Continuing Problems of Arbitration	230
8.6	Central Banks and Certain Unsettled Problems	234
8.7	Some Problems Relating to the Act of State Doctrine	241
8.7.1	National Courts and Foreign Acts of State.....	241
8.8	The Overlap of Act of State and Sovereign Immunity.....	243
8.9	Final Remarks	249
9	State Immunity and the Violation of International Law	251
9.1	Preliminary Matters	251
9.2	Private Suits Against States for Violating Human Rights.....	251
9.3	The State, Recognition and Juridical Equality.....	253
9.3.1	Immunities of Heads of States and Senior State Officials.....	254
9.4	Recent Case Law on International Law Crimes.....	256

9.4.1	General Pinochet before English Courts	257
9.4.2	Ex-President Habre before the Courts of Senegal and France.....	261
9.4.3	Colonel Qaddafi before the Courts of France	262
9.4.4	A Brief Study of <i>Jus Cogens</i> and the <i>Obligaciones Erga Omnes</i>	265
9.5	UK and Ireland before the European Court of Human Rights	268
9.6	State Immunity and World War Two Damage Claims	270
9.6.1	Germany before Greek Courts	271
9.7	Some Salient Legal Issues before the ICJ	273
9.7.1	The Legality of Use of Force before the ICJ.....	273
9.7.2	Congo v. the Kingdom of Belgium	279
9.7.3	The Immunity of a Foreign Minister in International Law	279
9.8	Immunity, International Crimes and American Courts	287
9.8.1	USSR Before American Courts.....	288
9.8.2	Hugo Princz v. Germany before American Courts	289
9.9	Amendment to US FSIA of 1976.....	293
9.10	Final Remarks	295
10.	UN Draft Convention on State Immunity	301
10.1	Acceptance of the Proposed Draft Convention	301
10.2	The Concept of the State for Purpose of Immunity	302
10.3	State Enterprise and Commercial Transactions	303
10.4	Commercial Character of a Contract or Transaction	305
10.5	Contract of Employment.....	307
10.6	Measures of Constraint Against the State	308
10.7	A Perspective Sketch of Possible Future Problems	312
10.8	Conclusion	314
11	The Current Law of State Immunity	317
11.1	Some Thoughts on the Law	317
11.2	The Current State of the Law	317
11.3	The Changing Scope of Sovereign Immunity	319
11.4	A Look at Current State Practice.....	324
11.4.1	Some Evidence of State Practice.....	327
11.5	Asian–African Legal Consultative Committee’s Report	339
11.6	Further Reflections on the State of the Law.....	341
11.6.1	Some Salient Issues.....	341
11.7	Embassy Bank Accounts and Foreign Reserves	344
11.8	Employment Contracts and Restrictive Immunity	347
11.9	The Future of the Law of Sovereign Immunity	356
12	Conclusion:	361
12.1	A Proposal for Resolving the Controversy	361
Appendix	369
	Treaty of Westphalia	369
	The Schooner Exchange Decision.....	399
	Judge Weiss Concept of Restrictive Immunity (1922).....	407
	The Tate Letter	409

European Convention on State Immunity	411
US: Foreign Immunities Act of 1976	423
UK: Immunity Act of 1978	431
The Singapore State Immunity Act of 1979.....	443
The Pakistani State Immunity Ordinance 1981	449
South African Foreign State Immunities Act 1981	455
The ILA Montreal Draft Convention	461
Foreign States Immunities Act No. 196 of 1985.....	467
State Immunities Act, Chapter S-18.....	485
ILC Draft Articles on Jurisdictional Immunities.....	491
UN Draft Convention on State Immunity	501
Selected Bibliography	517
Index.....	535