

# Contents

Acknowledgments . . . . .	11
Introduction . . . . .	15
PART I: Historical Context and its Differing Historiographic Narratives . . . . .	29
1 THE PRE-1948 PERIOD . . . . .	31
2 THE PALESTINIAN EXODUS . . . . .	39
2.1 The First Stage: December 1947 to March 1948 . . . . .	39
2.2 The Second Stage: The Mass Exodus from April to June 1948 . . . . .	40
2.3 The Atrocity Factor . . . . .	43
2.3.1 The Jewish Role in the Palestinian Exodus up to June 1948 . . . . .	44
2.3.2 The Arab Role in the Palestinian Exodus up to June 1948 . . . . .	46
2.3.3 Jewish Reactions to the Palestinian Exodus . . . . .	48
2.3.4 Arab Reactions to the Palestinian Exodus . . . . .	49
2.4 The Third Stage: The “Ten Days” of July 1948 . . . . .	50
2.5 The Fourth Stage: October and November 1948 . . . . .	53
2.6 Socio-economic Factors . . . . .	55
2.7 The Exodus: A Result of Multiple Causation . . . . .	56
3 AFTER 1948 . . . . .	59
3.1 The Immediate Post-War Period . . . . .	59
3.2 1967: A Further Wave of Refugees . . . . .	63

4	TWO DIFFERENT NARRATIVES . . . . .	67
4.1	The Israeli Narrative . . . . .	67
4.2	The Palestinian Narrative . . . . .	72
5	THE SITUATION ON THE GROUND . . . . .	79
5.1	The Difficult Task of Estimating Refugee Numbers . . . . .	79
5.2	Definitions of a Palestinian Refugee . . . . .	81
5.2.1	Popular Definitions . . . . .	82
5.2.2	Official Definitions . . . . .	82
5.3	The Distribution of Palestinian Refugees . . . . .	84
5.3.1	Jordan . . . . .	88
5.3.2	West Bank and Gaza Strip . . . . .	89
5.3.3	Syria . . . . .	90
5.3.4	Lebanon . . . . .	91
5.3.5	Egypt . . . . .	93
	PART II: Contradictory Interpretations of the <i>Right of Return</i> . . . . .	95
6	IS THERE A <i>RIGHT OF RETURN</i> ? . . . . .	97
6.1	Israeli Views . . . . .	99
6.1.1	Regarding Palestinian Refugees . . . . .	99
6.1.2	Regarding Jewish Refugees from Arab Countries . . . . .	102
6.2	Palestinian Views . . . . .	103
7	LEGAL PERSPECTIVES . . . . .	111
7.1	The <i>Right of Return</i> as a Treaty Obligation? . . . . .	112
7.2	The <i>Right of Return</i> and Customary International Law . . . . .	118
7.3	U.N. General Assembly Resolution 194 . . . . .	121
7.4	The Practice of Refugee Return . . . . .	126

PART III: Why and How the Issue of Refugees Has Remained a Stumbling Block at the Peace Talks . . . . .	137
8 DURING THE COLD WAR . . . . .	139
8.1 The Lausanne Conference, April–September 1949 . . . . .	139
8.2 The Geneva Conference, January 1950 . . . . .	140
8.3 The Paris Conference, September–November 1951 . . . . .	141
8.4 The Geneva Conference, December 1973 to January 1974 . . . . .	142
8.5 Camp David, September 1978 . . . . .	142
9 INITIALIZING ISRAELI-PALESTINIAN NEGOTIATIONS . . . . .	145
9.1 The Parties Start to Talk: The Madrid Conference, October–November 1991 . . . . .	145
9.1.1 The Multilateral Track: The Refugee Working Group . . . . .	146
9.1.2 The “Ottawa Process” . . . . .	150
9.2 A First Breakthrough: The 1993 Declaration of Principles and the Interim Agreement . . . . .	151
9.2.1 The Israeli–Jordanian Peace Treaty, 1994 . . . . .	152
9.2.2 The Quadripartite Committee . . . . .	153
9.3 A Detailed yet Unsuccessful Proposal: The Beilin–Abu Mazen Agreement, 1995 . . . . .	154
9.3.1 Within Israel: The Beilin–Eitan Agreement, 1997. . . . .	157
10 TACKLING FINAL STATUS NEGOTIATIONS . . . . .	159
10.1 Harpsund, May 2000: Tackling the Refugee Issue for the First Time . . . . .	159

10.2	Camp David, July 2000: The Beginning of Oslo's End . . . . .	163
10.2.1	Slim Chances for Success . . . . .	164
10.2.2	The Course of the Negotiations on Refugees . . . . .	167
10.2.3	The Collapse of Camp David: Reasons and Lessons . . . . .	185
10.3	The Clinton Parameters: A Guiding Line for the Refugee Question . . . . .	192
10.4	Taba, January 2001: Substantial Progress, yet Time Running Out . . . . .	197
10.4.1	The Talks on Refugees at Taba . . . . .	199
10.4.2	What Was Achieved at Taba? . . . . .	208
10.4.3	Lessons from Taba . . . . .	214
10.5	After Oslo: The Arab League's Proposal, the "Roadmap", and the Bush-Letter . . . . .	216
10.6	The Results of the Official Israeli-Palestinian Negotiations on Refugees . . . . .	219
PART IV: In Search of Sustainable Solutions . . . . .		223
11	PRACTICAL SOLUTIONS . . . . .	227
11.1	Abu Sitta: All Palestinian Refugees Must and Can Return to Israel . . . . .	228
11.1.1	The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	228
11.1.2	Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	230
11.1.3	The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	232
11.2	The Citizenship/Residency Approach . . . . .	233
11.2.1	The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	233
11.2.2	Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	234
11.2.3	The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	236
11.3	The 1948 Approach . . . . .	237
11.3.1	The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	237
11.3.2	Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	238
11.3.3	The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	241

11.4	The Geneva Initiative . . . . .	242
11.4.1	The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	244
11.4.2	Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	247
11.4.3	The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	252
11.5	The Internal Approach . . . . .	255
11.5.1	The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	255
11.5.2	Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	257
11.5.3	The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	259
11.6	Israel's Traditional Approach . . . . .	260
11.6.1	The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	260
11.6.2	Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	260
11.6.3	The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	261
11.7	Agha and Malley: <i>Right of Return</i> to Swapped Areas . . . . .	262
11.7.1	The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	263
11.7.2	Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	265
11.7.3	The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	268
12	PRINCIPLED SOLUTIONS . . . . .	269
12.1	Peled and Rouhana: Transitional Justice . . . . .	270
12.1.1	The Idea of Transitional Justice . . . . .	271
12.1.2	Application to the <i>Right of Return</i> . . . . .	272
12.1.3	The Relevance of Transitional Justice . . . . .	274
12.2	Learning from German-Israeli Negotiations . . . . .	275
12.2.1	The Question of Formulation . . . . .	276
12.2.2	Differences and Parallels to the Israeli-Palestinian Case . . . . .	282
12.2.3	Lessons for the Palestinian Refugee Question . . . . .	285
13	INTEGRATED SOLUTIONS . . . . .	295
13.1	A Bi-national State . . . . .	295
13.1.1	The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	296
13.1.2	Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	299
13.1.3	The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	303

13.2 A Palestinian Compromise Solution . . . . .	306
13.2.1 The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	306
13.2.2 Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	307
13.2.3 The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	309
13.3 An Israeli Compromise Solution . . . . .	310
13.3.1 The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	310
13.3.2 Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	312
13.3.3 The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	313
13.4 The Gush Shalom Proposal . . . . .	314
13.4.1 The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	315
13.4.2 Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	316
13.4.3 The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	318
13.5 The Ayalon-Nusseibeh Proposal . . . . .	319
13.5.1 The Essence of the Proposal . . . . .	320
13.5.2 Analysis of the Proposal . . . . .	320
13.5.3 The Proposal's Relevance . . . . .	323
Conclusions . . . . .	327
14.1 Summary . . . . .	327
14.1.1 Historical Background . . . . .	327
14.1.2 The Legal Background of the <i>Right of Return</i> . .	329
14.1.3 Political Background . . . . .	333
14.1.4 Proposals for Sustainable Solutions . . . . .	337
14.2 Recommendations for Future Negotiations . . . . .	344
Bibliography . . . . .	355