

# Contents

Prologue.....	VII
Abbreviations.....	IX
<b>I. SCOPE AND METHOD OF THE THESIS.....</b>	<b>1</b>
A. The United Nations, Specialized and Related Agencies.....	1
B. Scope of Procurement Activities .....	2
C. Coordination of Procurement .....	4
D. Access to Internal Documentation.....	5
E. Methodological Aspects .....	7
1. Findings of the Independent Inquiry Committee.....	7
2. Comparison with the Procurement Regime under the Government Procurement Agreement of the WTO .....	9
<b>II. REGULATORY FRAMEWORK OF THE UNITED NATIONS .....</b>	<b>13</b>
A. Procurement Rules.....	13
1. “Rules of the Organization” .....	13
2. Codification or Progressive Development .....	15
B. Hierarchy of Norms .....	18
C. Primary Source: Constitutive Treaty .....	18
1. United Nations Charter and Powers of its Principal Organs .....	18
2. Power to Promulgate United Nations Financial Regulations .....	20
3. Power to Promulgate United Nations Staff Regulations .....	22
D. Secondary Source: Regulations .....	22
1. United Nations Financial Regulations.....	22
2. Power to Issue United Nations Financial Rules .....	24
3. United Nations Staff Regulations.....	25
4. Power to Issue United Nations Staff Rules .....	27
E. Tertiary Source: Rules .....	27
1. United Nations Financial Rules.....	27
2. Institutional aspects .....	28
a.) authority .....	28
b.) control .....	29

c.) “substantive” or “technical officers” .....	30
d.) Committee on Contracts .....	31
3. Substantive aspects .....	33
a.) competition .....	33
b.) advertising .....	33
c.) formal invitation of tenders versus informal calling for proposals .....	34
d.) exceptions to competition .....	36
e.) public opening of bids .....	38
f.) selection criteria .....	38
g.) currency availability .....	40
h.) rejection of all bids .....	40
F. Quaternary Source: Administrative Instructions .....	41
1. Power to Issue United Nations Administrative Instructions .....	41
G. United Nations System .....	43
1. Constitution of UNIDO and Powers of its Principal Organs .....	44
2. Power to Approve UNIDO Financial Regulations .....	45
3. Power to Establish UNIDO Staff Regulations .....	46
4. UNIDO Financial Regulations .....	46
5. UNIDO Staff Regulations .....	47
6. Power to Issue UNIDO Financial Rules .....	47
7. Power to Issue UNIDO Staff Rules .....	47
8. UNIDO Financial Rules .....	48
9. Power to Issue UNIDO Administrative Instructions .....	48
H. Purposes of the Formal Norms .....	49
I. Promoting Observance of the Procurement Norms and Procedures .....	50
1. Variety and Effectiveness of Measures .....	50
2. Reform of the Formal Procedural Norms .....	51
3. Internal Reorganisation, Selection and Training of Staff .....	52
4. Criminal Law Enforcement and Disciplinary Measures against Staff Members .....	52
a.) criminal jurisdiction .....	52
b.) disciplinary measures .....	54
J. Accountability for Compliance with the Procurement Norms .....	56
1. Accountability of the Secretary-General to Member States .....	57
a.) management and oversight .....	57
b.) appointment of staff .....	58

2. Other Remedies of Member States.....	60
3. Third-Party Settlement of Procurement Disputes.....	63
a.) immunity from jurisdiction .....	63
b.) determination of official acts and waiver of immunity .....	65
c.) CPIUN, CPISA and UNIDO.....	66
d.) the nature of immunity.....	67
e.) waiver of the Organization’s immunity .....	68
f.) non-judicial dispute settlement: arbitration.....	69
(1) standard clauses .....	69
(2) scope of arbitration .....	71
<b>III. THE PROCUREMENT PROCESS AND ITS ACTORS .....</b>	<b>75</b>
A. Introduction .....	75
B. Organisational Structure .....	75
C. Procurement Planning.....	76
D. Coordination of Legal Aspects .....	78
E. Requisitions, Terms of Reference and Technical Specifications.....	79
1. The Raising of Requisitions .....	79
2. Terms of Reference and Technical Specifications .....	81
a.) Terms of Reference.....	81
b.) Technical Specifications .....	81
F. Authorized Procurement Officers.....	82
G. Sole Source Procurement.....	83
H. Competitive Procedures.....	85
I. Solicitation Documents.....	86
J. Submission Deadline, Clarification of Solicitation Documents, Receipt and Opening of Bids.....	87
K. Evaluation of Bids .....	89
1. Criteria .....	89
2. Process .....	89
a.) bids submitted in one sealed envelope and unsealed bids.....	90
b.) bids submitted in two sealed envelopes .....	90
L. Clarification of Bids and Negotiations .....	91
M. Review by the Committee on Contracts and the Award Decision.....	91

IV. THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION'S PROCUREMENT REGIME COMPARED TO THE UNITED NATIONS REGIME.....	93
A. Legal Framework.....	93
1. The WTO Agreement.....	93
2. The GATT (1994).....	95
3. The GATS.....	95
4. The TRIPS.....	96
5. Coverage of Government Procurement.....	97
a.) GATT (1994).....	97
b.) GATS.....	100
c.) TRIPS.....	101
6. The Government Procurement Agreement.....	102
a.) plurilateral agreement.....	102
b.) purposes.....	104
c.) applicability and coverage.....	106
B. Comparison between the GPA's and the United Nations Procedures.....	108
1. General Comparison.....	108
2. Specific Comparisons.....	108
a.) technical specifications.....	108
b.) the three tendering procedures.....	109
c.) qualification of suppliers.....	110
d.) invitation to participate: intended procurement.....	111
e.) time-limits for tendering and delivery.....	114
f.) tender documentation and award criteria.....	115
g.) submission, receipt and opening of tenders.....	117
h.) negotiations.....	118
i.) limited tendering.....	119
j.) transparency, provision of information and review.....	121
(1) transparency for non-Parties.....	121
(2) information by procuring entities.....	122
(3) information by Parties.....	123
(4) United Nations procurement regime.....	124
k.) challenge procedures.....	124
(1) complaint and consultation.....	124
(2) procedural standards.....	126

(3) procedure .....	127
(4) remedies .....	128
3. Dispute Settlement Understanding .....	130
a.) applicability of the Dispute Settlement Understanding .....	130
b.) Dispute Settlement Body .....	131
c.) nature and purpose .....	132
d.) subject matter and establishment of panels .....	133
e.) amicable settlement .....	134
f.) panel proceedings .....	135
g.) composition and decision-making procedure of the DSB .....	136
h.) the appellate review body .....	137
i.) remedies .....	138
C. Distinctions Between the GPA and the United Nations Procurement Rules .....	140
V. FINDINGS OF THE INDEPENDENT INQUIRY COMMITTEE .....	143
A. The Independent Inquiry Committee .....	143
1. Establishment .....	143
2. Mandate .....	144
B. The Iraq Oil-for-Food Programme .....	146
1. Mandate from the Security Council .....	146
2. Memorandum of Understanding with the Government of Iraq .....	148
C. Legal Framework for Implementation of the Oil-for-Food Programme .....	152
1. The Security Council Resolution, the Memorandum of Understanding and Procurement .....	152
a.) scope of the resolution and of the memorandum .....	152
b.) the escrow account and the bank account .....	154
c.) consultations with the Government of Iraq .....	155
d.) approval by the Government of Iraq .....	155
2. Establishment of the Iraq Steering Committee in the Secretariat .....	156
D. Procurement of Banking Services .....	157
1. The Nature of the Escrow Account and of Consultations with the Government of Iraq .....	157
2. Choice of a Selection Procedure and Preparation of a List of Invitees .....	158

3.	Consultations with the Government of Iraq on the Invitee List.....	160
4.	Evaluation of the Proposals and Intervention by the United States .....	161
5.	The Final Selection by the Secretary-General .....	162
6.	Preponderance of Political Considerations.....	164
E.	Procurement of Oil Export Inspection Services.....	165
1.	Analysis of the Mandate .....	165
2.	Preliminary Steps Taken by the Substantive Officer .....	166
3.	Choice of the Established Competitive Bidding Procedure for the Selection .....	167
4.	Distribution of the Request for Proposals and the Deadline for Submission of Proposals.....	168
5.	Evaluation of the Original Proposals and Request for Pricing Updates.....	168
6.	Passing of Information to a Bidder through a Foreign Ministry.....	170
7.	Passing of Information to a Bidder through a Middleman .....	171
8.	The Updated Proposals.....	172
9.	Request for Confirmation and Explanation of Pricing .....	174
10.	Final Evaluation and Award.....	174
F.	Procurement of Inspection Services for the Importation of Goods.....	176
1.	The Mandate.....	176
2.	Preliminary Steps Taken by the Permanent Mission of the United Kingdom and by the Substantive Officer.....	176
3.	The Request for Proposals and Submission of Proposals.....	177
4.	The Evaluation.....	178
5.	Passing of Information to a Bidder through a Permanent Mission .....	179
6.	Intervention by the Steering Committee.....	180
7.	Implementation of the Steering Committee's Decision.....	182
G.	Causes of the Infringements found by the IIC .....	184
1.	Inadequate Planning and Preparation .....	185
2.	Procurement Outside the Established Procedure .....	188
3.	Infringement of Confidentiality .....	189
4.	Clarification of Proposals versus Revision of a Request for Proposals .....	190
5.	Rejection of All Proposals on Political Grounds .....	191
6.	Selection on Political Grounds .....	192
7.	Common Causes.....	192

VI. ACCOUNTABILITY FOR UNITED NATIONS	
PROCUREMENT ACTIONS .....	195
A. Sources of International Law on Accountability of International	
Organisations .....	195
1. International Conventions .....	195
2. International Custom .....	197
3. General Principles of Law .....	197
B. Level and Nature of United Nations Procurement Rules	
and Actions .....	199
C. Accountability and Immunity .....	203
1. Purpose of Immunity .....	203
2. Judicial and Arbitral Remedies .....	203
3. Procurement Regime .....	205
4. Political Context .....	205
VII. <i>DE LEGE FERENDA</i> .....	207
A. Comparison with the GPA .....	207
B. Recommendations .....	207
1. Structure of Procurement Rules .....	207
2. Purposes .....	208
3. Independence .....	208
4. Consultations and other Amicable Settlement Procedures .....	209
5. Challenge Procedure .....	210
6. Transparency .....	211
7. By-passing Procedures .....	212
8. Pre-selection of Potential Suppliers .....	212
9. Information to be included in Invitations to Bid .....	213
10. Provision of Official Information .....	213
11. Unauthorized Official .....	214
12. Short Deadline for Submissions .....	214
13. Passing Information to a Supplier .....	214
14. Unauthorized Reduction of Price and Acceptance of	
Reduced Price .....	215
15. Non-recording and Concealment of Reason for Rejecting	
All Proposals .....	216

VIII. CONCLUSION .....	217
ANNEX I	
UNDP/IAPSO: General business Guide Common Guidelines for Procurement by Organizations in the UN System (20 <sup>th</sup> Edition – Update June 2006) .....	221
ANNEX II	
Financial Regulations and Rules of the United Nations – Excerpts ST/SGB/Financial Rules/1/Rev.3 (1985) .....	233
ANNEX III	
Financial Regulations and Rules of the United Nations – Excerpts ST/SGB/2003/7 (9 May 2003) .....	253
BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	269