

Table of Contents

List of Graphs, Tables and Charts	15
List of Abbreviations	17
1. Introduction of the Research Subject 'Differentiated Integration at Work'	19
1.1 A Structuring Approach to Differentiated Integration: State of the Art, Key Aspects and Core Research Questions	19
1.2 Research Design: The Case, Variables, Assumptions, Methodology	27
1.3 Le Fil Rouge: Structure and Outline of the Study	36
2. Conceptualisation and Theorising of Differentiated Integration at Work	38
2.1 Differentiated Integration: Conceptualisation of a Blurry Term	38
2.1.1 Structuring the Supercharged Debate on Differentiated Integration	39
2.1.2 Theorising Differentiated Integration: The Neglected Case in Traditional European Integration Theory?	46
2.2 Theorising Differentiated Integration at Work: Bringing Historical Institutionalism Back in	50
2.2.1 Theoretical Findings on Differentiated Integration as Second-Best Solution and Its Rationale	52
2.2.1.1 Formation of Structures of Differentiated Policy-/ Decision-Making	54
2.2.1.2 Introducing Path Dependence to the Analysis	58
2.2.2 The Stickiness of Structures of Differentiated Policy-/ Decision-Making	61
2.2.3 Review of the Explanatory Benefits and Limits of Historical Institutionalism in Light of the Paths of Differentiated Integration at Work	66
2.3 Theorising Differentiated Integration at Work: The Influence of Centripetal and Centrifugal Effects	70
2.3.1 Relevance of Externalities and Member State Action	72
2.3.2 Structural and Functional Differentiation and Externalities: Establishing the Net-Benefits of the General Opt-out	80

2.4 The Paths to Differentiated Integration at Work: Guiding Assumptions and Working Theses	86
3. Operationalisation of the Analytical Frame and the Case of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	93
3.1 Legal Framework: Delineation of Flexibility and Differentiation	95
3.1.1 Flexibility Tools: Uniform Primary Law and Differentiated Secondary Law	101
3.1.1.1 Asynchronous but Common Integration: Safeguard Clauses and Principal Derogations	103
3.1.1.2 General Authorisation of Different Rules for Different Member States: Much Ado about Nothing?	108
3.1.1.3 Constructive Abstention: Case-by-Case Flexibility within CFSP	112
3.1.2 Differentiated Integration Tools: Actual Differentiation in Primary Law	114
3.1.2.1 The Economic and Monetary Union	115
3.1.2.2 The Common Security and Defence Policy	118
3.1.2.3 The Charter of Fundamental Rights	119
3.1.2.4 The Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	122
3.1.3 A Conclusive Assessment of the Institutionalisation of Opt-Outs in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice as Independent Variable	125
3.2 Driving Forces of the Paths of Differentiated Integration at Work in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	126
3.2.1 The Institutional Design: Determination of the Relevance of Access Points for the ‘Outs’ in Differentiated Decision-Making	127
3.2.2 Externalities: The Pressure for Circumvention of Differentiated Integration	131
3.2.3 Domestic Conditions: Referendum as Key to Joining the European Fold?	138
3.3 Configuration of the Patterns of Differentiated Integration at Work in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	141
3.3.1 Catching a Structuring Glimpse on the Policies of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	141
3.3.2 Guiding Assumptions Refined: Yardsticks for Patterns of Differentiated Integration at Work	145

4. The Cornerstones of Differentiated Integration at Work in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	151
4.1 The Slow Process of Communitarisation: From Schengen and Maastricht to Lisbon	152
4.1.1 The Schengen Agreement as Backbone of Differentiation: Helpful Laboratory or Trauma?	153
4.1.1.1 Aspects of Variable Geometries in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	154
4.1.1.2 Incorporation of the Schengen Acquis into the EU's Legal Framework: Consequences of the Ventilation Approach for the 'Outs'	161
4.1.2 Intergovernmental and Supranational Policy-/Decision-Making and the Question of Access	166
4.1.2.1 Access Points in the Institutional Architecture of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	166
4.1.2.2 Flexibility Tools in the Light of Differentiated and Undifferentiated Policy-Making	172
4.2 Spill-over Alarm within a Densely Interconnected Policy Area	175
4.2.1 The Full Circle of 'Freedom', 'Security' and 'Justice'	176
4.2.2 The Inter-linkage of Individual Policies and Policy Measures	178
4.3 Outsider Member States' Positions in Light of Centripetal Effects of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	185
4.3.1 The United Kingdom: A Stranger in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice?	186
4.3.2 Ireland: The Pragmatist	195
4.3.3 Denmark: In Defence of Intergovernmental Cooperation	201
5. Institutionalisation of Differentiated Integration in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice: a Plethora of Provisions and a High Complexity	208
5.1 The Schengen Protocol: The Permission for Two 'Outs' to Opt-In and One 'In' to Be Out	209
5.1.1 The United Kingdom and Ireland: Legal Rights to Participate in the Schengen Acquis in Spite of the Maintenance of Borders	210
5.1.2 Denmark: Preservation of the Intergovernmental Character of the Schengen Cooperation	217
5.2 The Title IV TEC / Title V TFEU Protocol: Freedom of Choice vs. Operability of the Acquis	220
5.2.1 The United Kingdom and Ireland: Knocking on Open Doors?	221

5.2.2 Denmark: Knocking on Closed Doors?	226
5.3 The Abolition of the Opt-Outs: Rather Low Chances to Terminate Differentiation?	227
6. The ‘Living Procedures’ of Differentiated Integration in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	230
6.1 The European Level: Estimating the Costs of Differentiated Policy-/Decision-Making	231
6.1.1 The Commission: The Neutral Broker in the Paths of Differentiated Integration at Work	232
6.1.2 The Council Working Structures: Everyone on Board	234
6.2 The Domestic Level: Veto Points and the Ability to Fully Exploit the Participation Rights	238
6.2.1 Ireland and the United Kingdom: Time Pressure and Parliamentary Scrutiny	239
6.2.2 Denmark: Veto Points Determined by the Question of Sovereignty Transfer	243
7. Patterns of Implementation of Differentiated Integration	246
7.1 Patterns of Implementation of Differentiated Integration: Schengen	247
7.1.1 Effects of Structural Differentiation in Schengen: Either in or Out?	247
7.1.2 Policy Participation in Schengen Matters: Clear Patterns and No Surprises	252
7.1.3 Completion of the Picture of Differentiated Integration at Work: Schengen	254
7.2 Patterns of Implementation of Differentiated Integration: Title IV TEC / Title V TFEU	256
7.2.1 Effects of Structural Differentiation: A History of Abuses, Kick-Outs, and Spill-Overs	256
7.2.1.1 Abusing the Opt-in Regime	257
7.2.1.2 Cross-References and Participation Spill-Over	261
7.2.1.3 Participation in Second Generation Legislation: Neither a Free Ticket nor a Participation Guarantee	265
7.2.1.4 Having the Doors Shut in Their Faces: Unintended Denial of Participation	268
7.2.2 Finding a Compromise within a Tailor-Made Opt-In	273
7.2.3 Policy Participation: Cherry Picking but Still Coherent Participation	275

7.2.4 Completion of the Picture of Differentiated Integration at Work: Title IV TEC / Title V TFEU	280
8. Conclusions and Outlook	282
8.1 Differentiated Integration at Work: How to Close the Research Gaps	283
8.2 Patterns of Differentiated Integration at Work in the AFSJ	284
8.3 Acceleration Consolidation Fragmentation: What is it Going to Be?	292
8.4 The Paths of Differentiated Integration at Work: Mission Accomplished?	297
8.5 Outlook and Future Research Agendas	299
9. References	301
9.1 Primary Sources	301
9.2 Interviews	309
9.3 Literature	310
9.4 Newspaper Articles	329