

# Contents

Acknowledgements	5
Abbreviations and Acronyms	11
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>15</b>
Why Study Borders?	18
Study Outline	21
<b>2 Theoretical Approaches to Borders and Orders</b>	<b>25</b>
2.1. Research Objectives	25
2.2. Hypotheses on Drivers for Cross-Border Transactions	26
2.3. Borders, Orders, Borderlands and Cross-Border Transactions	28
2.3.1. Boundary, Border or Frontier?	28
2.3.2. Producing and Reproducing Borders	30
2.3.2.1. Borders as Markers of Territorial Rule	34
2.3.2.2. Borders as Membranes	35
2.3.2.3. Borders as Defining Lines for the Formation of Identities	36
2.3.3. Borders, Orders and States	38
2.3.3.1. The Historical Narratives of Borders, Orders and States	39
2.3.3.2. Problems of State Building Outside the 'Western World'	45
2.3.3.3. Territoriality and the Challenge of Globalisation and Regionalisation	46
2.3.3.4. Challenged by Failure	50
2.3.3.5. Sovereignty and Alternatives	53
2.3.3.6. De-Territorialisation and Re-Territorialisation	55
2.3.4. The Relevance of Borderlands...	56
2.3.4.1. ... as Discussed in the Literature	56
2.3.4.2. ... Based on the Functions of Borders	58
2.3.4.3. Borderlanders' Identities	60
2.3.4.4. Types of Borderlands	63

2.3.5.	Cross-Border Interactions between Cooperation and Control	67
2.3.5.1.	The Geographical Context Factor of Being Landlocked	68
2.3.5.2.	Opportunity, Trust, Reciprocity, Vulnerability, Interdependence – What Motivates Cooperation?	71
2.3.5.3.	On Security Cooperation: Do Good Fences Make Good Neighbours?	76
2.3.6.	Effects on Border Management	82
<b>3</b>	<b>Trajectories of Borders and Orders</b>	<b>89</b>
3.1.	Geographical Context	89
3.2.	History of States, Borders and Interactions on the Amu Darya	91
3.2.1.	Empires in a Zone of Transition	92
3.2.2.	Weak Political Orders – Strong Translocal Ties	93
3.2.3.	Empires Reloaded: the ‘Great Game’ and the River as Border	95
3.2.4.	New States: Soviet Union and Independent Afghanistan	97
3.2.5.	State Building and the Fostering of the Soviet–Afghan Border	98
3.2.6.	Ruptures in the Sociocultural Structure of Soviet Central Asia	103
3.2.7.	From Friendly Buffer State to Battlefield	104
3.2.8.	Withdrawal from Afghanistan and Upheaval in Soviet Central Asia	107
3.3.	Summary	110
<b>4</b>	<b>State and Nation Building since 1991</b>	<b>113</b>
4.1.	‘Who Are We – And If So, How Many?’ The Ethnic Ascriptions of the Population	113
4.2.	New States and New Borders	116
4.3.	The Cross-Border Dimension of Wars in Afghanistan and Tajikistan	120
4.3.1.	Failed States and War Economies	122
4.3.2.	Uzbek Interventions	125
4.3.3.	Migration	128
4.4.	The State of State and Nation Building	130
4.4.1.	State and Nation Building in Afghanistan	130
4.4.2.	State and Nation Building in Central Asia	136

4.4.2.1.	Historicising (Post-)Soviet Identities for Nation Building	136
4.4.2.2.	Soviet and Pre-Soviet Legacies	139
4.4.3.	State and Nation Building in Tajikistan	140
4.4.3.1.	Digging Deeply into History for the Future Nation	142
4.4.3.2.	Subnational Regionalism	144
4.4.4.	State and Nation Building in Uzbekistan	146
4.4.4.1.	The Concept of Ethnic Nationalism	148
4.4.4.2.	Keep Out the Evil! The Relevance of Borders	149
4.5.	Summary: The Production of States and Borders	153
<b>5</b>	<b>Regionalisation in the Local Borderlands</b>	<b>159</b>
5.1.	Between Uzbekistan and Afghanistan From Mazar-i Sharif (Afghanistan) to Termez via Hairatan	159 165
5.2.	Between Uzbekistan (Surkhondaryo) and Tajikistan (RRS and Dushanbe) From Shaartuz (Tajikistan) to Termez via the border post at Gulbakhor From Termez to Dushanbe via the border port at Uzun	176 176 181
5.3.	Between Tajikistan and Afghanistan From Sher Khan Bandar (Afghanistan) to Qumsangir (Tajikistan) Between Kulob (Khatlon Province, Tajikistan) and Takhar (Afghanistan) Between GBAO (Tajikistan) and Badakhshan (Afghanistan) From Qalaikhum to Khorog Between Shughnon (GBAO, Tajikistan) and Sheghnan (Afghan Badakhshan)	189 205 206 212 221 222
5.4.	Summary	227
<b>6</b>	<b>Regionalism and Transnational Relations</b>	<b>239</b>
6.1.	Regional Actors	239
6.1.1.	The Bigger Players – USA, Russia and China	240
6.1.2.	Regional Players	247
6.1.2.1.	Iran	247
6.1.2.2.	Pakistan	250
6.1.2.3.	India	253
6.1.2.4.	Turkey	255

6.1.2.5.	The European Union – a Newcomer in the Game	255
6.1.3.	Adapting to the Multiplicity of Actors	257
6.2.	Regional Initiatives and Organisations	259
6.2.1.	Arrangements in the post-Soviet Realm	261
6.2.2.	Water and Energy Interdependence	264
6.2.3.	Economic Initiatives with Central Asian Roots	270
6.2.4.	Regional Organisations Exceeding the post-Soviet Space	272
6.2.5.	Externally Induced Regional Initiatives	276
6.2.6.	Excursion: Drug Traffic in Central Asia	281
6.2.7.	Summary	288
6.3.	Regional Trade and Transit Potential	290
6.3.1	Impediments to Enhanced Regional Trade?	298
6.4.	Transnational Bilateral Relations...	305
6.4.1	... between Tajikistan and Uzbekistan	305
6.4.2	... between Uzbekistan and Afghanistan	308
6.4.3	... between Tajikistan and Afghanistan	309
6.5.	Summary: The State of Regionalism in Greater Central Asia	311
<b>7</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	<b>319</b>
7.1.	The Narratives of Borders and Orders at the Amu Darya	320
7.1.1.	Borders as Markers of Sovereignty – the Power-related Narrative	320
7.1.1.1.	Borderland Governance	323
7.1.1.2.	Border Management – Security to the Front	325
7.1.2.	Borders as Membranes – the Economic Narrative	326
7.1.3.	Borders as Markers of Identity	328
7.1.4.	Regional Interdependence and Regional Cooperation	330
7.2.	The Significance of Theories to Explain Failed Regionalism in Central Asia	333
7.2.1.	The Degree of Regionalisation: Higher in the Mountains	337
7.3.	Summary: Drivers of and Constraints on Cross-Border Interactions	338
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>347</b>
	<b>Appendix</b>	<b>389</b>