Tabel of Contents

Research in Review: A Brief Synopsis ................................................. 11
Forschungsbilanz und Zusammenfassung ........................................... 14
Acknowledgements .............................................................................. 18
Preface to the Research ...................................................................... 20
  Transliteration, Language, and Spelling ......................................... 20
  Researcher Biases ............................................................................ 20
  Community Concerns ....................................................................... 22

1 The Emergence of Participatory Development
in Development Theory and Approaches ........................................... 24
1.1 Researching Community Driven Development
in Afghanistan .................................................................................... 24
1.2 Historical Shifts in Development Theory
and Approaches ............................................................................... 27
  1.2.1 The Emergence of Development Studies
       Following World War II .............................................................. 28
  1.2.2 Different Development Approaches in the Early Years:
       Community Development and Modernization Theory ............... 33
  1.2.3 Modernization Theory: Laying the Foundation of
       Mainstream Development Approaches .................................... 37
  1.2.4 Dependency Theory Rises in Response to the
       Failures of Modernization Theory ........................................... 43
  1.2.5 Expanding the Definition of Development beyond Economics:
       Shifts towards Participation ...................................................... 52
  1.2.6 NIEO and Efforts to Shift Power to the Periphery .................... 54
  1.2.7 Adding to Seers: Support for More Expansive Development
       Indicators ................................................................................... 56
  1.2.8 Basic Needs Approach: Introduction of Individuals into
       the Development Discourse ....................................................... 57
  1.2.9 World System Theory: Introducing More Nuance into
       Dependency Theory and Presenting a Multi-directional
       Model of Development .................................................................. 62
  1.2.10 Belief in the Forces of the Market: Neo-liberal Approaches
       Dominate ...................................................................................... 64
1.3 Movement towards Participatory Development ...........................................67
1.3.1 Participatory Approaches: People as Agents of Change .......................67
1.3.2 Human Development at Center Stage and a New Development Index .................................................................68
1.3.3 Human Security: Development Creating Security ...........................................73
1.3.4 Participatory Development: Development Centered Around the Agent .................................................................75
1.3.5 Post-Development: Problematizing “Development” ...........................................79
1.3.6 Extracting Meaning: Concluding Remarks on the History of Development Theory and Approaches .................................................................81
1.4 Participatory Development’s Rise in the Wake of Failed Top-Down Approaches .................................................................83
1.5 Exploration of Participatory Development in the Literature ......................86
1.5.1 Definitions of Participatory Development .................................................................88
1.5.2 The Process of Participation .................................................................95
1.5.3 Connecting Participatory Approaches and Effectiveness .......................99
1.5.4 Criticisms of Participatory Development .................................................................107
1.6 Extracting Meaning: The Historical Review .................................................................114

2 Situating the Research into a Framework of Analysis ..................................117
2.1 Research Stemming from a Historical Base and Specific Levels of Analysis .................................................................118
2.2 Inserting the Independent Variable: The National Solidarity Programme .................................................................121
2.3 Four Areas of Investigation .................................................................122
2.3.1 Personal Security .................................................................124
2.3.2 Economic Security .................................................................125
2.3.3 Social Security .................................................................126
2.3.4 Empowerment .................................................................128
2.4 The Additional Value and Importance of Applying a Gender Lens .............131
2.5 Extracting Meaning: The Analytical Framework ...........................................132
3 A Predominantly Qualitative Methodological Approach ......135
3.1 Methodological Demands of the Research Question ..........135
3.2 Limitations of the Methodological Approach ..................137
3.3 Empirical Research Tools and Sampling .......................139
3.3.1 The Centrality of the Household:
    The Semi-Structured Household Survey .......................139
3.3.2 Understanding a Community and Its Environs:
    The Research Tools ...........................................145
3.3.3 Gaining Access and Permission ..............................153
3.4 Difficulties and Challenges Encountered During the Fieldwork ........................................155
    3.4.1 Security ..................................................155
    3.4.2 Gender Segregation .......................................157
    3.4.3 Research Assistants and Working in Translation ........159
    3.4.4 Community Suspicions and Expectations .................160
3.5 Identifying the Fieldwork Research Location ..................161
    3.5.1 Selection of Northern Afghanistan .......................161
    3.5.2 Selection of Khulm District, Shah Raheem Community ....164
3.6 Bringing Together the Different Means of Data Collection ........................................166

4 A Case Study Situated in Afghanistan ..............................168
4.1 The Dominance of Modernization Theory in Historical Development Efforts .................................168
    4.1.1 Early Modernization Efforts (1919-1945) .................169
    4.1.2 Cold War Competition, Politics, and Development Aid Intertwine (1946-1978) .........................176
    4.1.3 Communist Rule: Afghanistan Becomes a Battleground (1978-1992) ........................................188
    4.1.4 Mujahideen “Governance” and the Internal Destruction of Afghanistan’s Infrastructural Assets (1992-1996) ........................................196
    4.1.5 Taliban Control and Further Destruction of the State’s Assets (1996-2001) .................................198
    4.1.6 Post-Taliban: A Tidal Wave of Development Efforts (2001 to present) ........................................202
6.2.1 NSP Meetings: Inclusion and Exclusion ........................................ 344
6.2.2 NSP Trainings: Limited Information and Impact ........................ 350
6.2.3 NSP Development Projects in Shah Raheem: Infrastructure Built and Mostly Utilized ......................................................... 352
6.2.4 Management and Maintenance of the Subprojects: A Male Endeavour ................................................................. 363
6.2.5 Sustainability of the NSP CDCs: Dependency on External Inputs ...... 365
6.2.6 Shah Raheem’s Internal Evaluation of the NSP: Positive Perceptions .. 368
6.3 Extracting Meaning: Evaluating the Implementation of the NSP in Shah Raheem ................................................................. 370

7 The Impact of the NSP on the Four Areas of Investigation in Shah Raheem ................................................................. 373
7.1 Personal Security: A Lack of Strong Positive or Negative Impacts ................................................................. 373
7.2 Economic Security: Minimal Positive Movements ......................... 379
7.3 Social Security: Small Positive Shifts for Some .......................... 383
7.3.1 Bonding Social Capital: Increased Connections for the Males of Shah Raheem ................................................................. 384
7.3.2 Bridging Social Capital: Limited Changes in Relationships with Outsiders ................................................................. 389
7.4 Empowerment: Only Slightly Impacted ......................................... 395
7.4.1 Access to Information Improved for Some ................................ 396
7.4.2 Inclusion and Participation is Selective .................................... 401
7.4.3 Accountability is Weak ......................................................... 405
7.4.4 Capacity to Organize is Not Strongly in Evidence ................. 408
7.5 Summarizing the Findings: The NSP’s Limited Impact on the Areas of Investigation ................................. 412

8 Bringing the Research into Perspective ......................................... 415
8.1 Applicability of this Research ..................................................... 415
8.1.1 Shah Raheem as Representative of NSP Communities in Khulm District ................................................................. 415
8.1.2 Shah Raheem as Representative of NSP Communities in General: Evidence of Inaccurate Data and Biases ........................................... 417
8.2 Reviewing the Research Findings ................................................ 421
8.2.1 Shah Raheem: Incremental Changes ................................................. 421
8.2.2 The NSP and Afghanistan: Raising Concerns ............................................. 423
8.2.3 Participatory Development in General: Hidden Realities ......................... 425
8.3 Coming to a Close: The NSP in Perspective .............................................. 430

Annex A: NSP Form 1: Community Profile ..................................................... 431
Annex B: NSP Form 2: CDC Election and Composition ...................................... 433
Annex C: NSP Form 5: Certification of Registration of CDC ................................. 438
Annex D: NSP Form 6: Community Development Plan ...................................... 441
Annex E: NSP Form 7: Subproject Proposal ..................................................... 444
Annex F: Household Survey Questionnaire ...................................................... 453
Annex G: Household Survey Participants ......................................................... 458
Annex H: Market Survey Questionnaire ......................................................... 460
Annex I: Shopkeeper Questionnaire .............................................................. 461
Annex J: Shopkeeper Questionnaire Participants .............................................. 462
Annex K: Facilitating Partner Staff Key Informant Interview Participants .............. 463
Annex L: Community Member Key Informant Interview Participants .................. 464
Annex M: External Key Informant Interview Participants .................................... 465
Annex N: Focus Group Discussions Held ........................................................ 466
Annex O: Map of the Khulm River Basin ......................................................... 467
Annex P: Transliteration of the Persian Alphabet ............................................ 468

Glossary of Terms ......................................................................................... 469
Acronyms ..................................................................................................... 474
List of Figures .............................................................................................. 479
List of Photos ............................................................................................... 481
Empirical and Primary Sources Consulted and Utilized .................................. 482
Secondary Sources Consulted and Cited ...................................................... 485